



THE  
**F L O R I D A**

HISTORICAL QUARTERLY

---

PUBLISHED BY THE FLORIDA HISTORICAL SOCIETY

SUMMER 1997

*Fatal Glory: Narciso López and the First Clandestine U.S. War Against Cuba.* By Tom Chaffin. (Charlottesville and London: University Press of Virginia, 1996. xxiv, 282 pp. Preface, chronology, introduction, illustrations, notes, bibliography, index. \$34.95 cloth.)

This is a slightly expanded revision of the author's Ph.D. dissertation, "Buffalo Hunt: Narciso López and the Clandestine U.S. War Against Cuba, 1848-1851" (Emory University, 1995). It describes the four Cuban filibuster expeditions organized by General Narciso López in the U.S. and opposed by the American government. The book contains a six-page chronology, a filibuster historiography from an American perspective, and good illustrations, although it includes only one map. The rush to publish, to compete

in a glutted academic job market, leaves this work ingloriously and fatally flawed. Using mostly secondary sources, Chaffin cites only six American and two Cuban manuscripts. Among the collections overlooked are the U.S. Department of State Miscellaneous Letters; the Despatches from U.S. Consuls in Havana; and the Secretary of the Navy Commanders' Letters, Squadron Letters and Miscellaneous Letters, containing hundreds of documents regarding the López expeditions. The author also neglected the Spanish archives in Madrid and Seville and the pro-filibuster newspapers *La Verdad* and *Cincinnati Nonpareil*.

A general omission of Cuban historiography seriously handicaps Chaffin's account. He tries window-dressing this problem with a smattering of Cuban sources, mostly cited in other works in English, but is hampered by his Spanish-language incomprehension. This is obvious when a Spanish sentinel is quoted as saying, "Halta! qui vive!" As a result, the author has been unable to digest Herminio Portell Vilá's seminal three-volume, 1,600-page biography, *Narciso López y su época (1930-1958)*. Chaffin categorizes López as an annexationist while ignoring that he also fought for Puerto Rican independence and plotted with former military subordinates in Cuba to stage garrison revolts coinciding with his landing. The author bases his annexationist argument on one filibuster proclamation written in English, a language that López did not understand. Chaffin does not analyze the three López proclamations in Spanish addressed to the Creoles, the Spanish citizens, and the soldiers, which do not mention annexation and promise independence. The book also fails to discern that slavery was a divisive issue in Cuban society, and that prominent filibusters Joaquín de Agüero, Gaspar Betancourt, Domingo de Goicouria, Plutarco González and Cirilo Villaverde, were abolitionists.

Important López expeditionary accounts receive scant coverage, while included are lengthy digressions into the histories of American cities and political parties, the penny press, Franciscan missions in California, and American personalities. In contrast, there are only two brief biographical sketches of Cuban filibusters, and the roles of Pedro de Agüero, Arnao, Arrieta, Chassagne, Echeverría, Gener, Goicouria, Plutarco González, Gotay, the Guiterras brothers, José M. Hernández, Lainé, Mendive, Rosis, Valiente, and others are omitted altogether. The American filibuster leaders neglected include the Gardiner brothers, William H. Bell, Lewis

Carr, Walter Biscoe, Samuel Koockogey, Peter Smith and Henry Theodore Titus, the organizer of the Jacksonville Battalion, who later fought in Bleeding Kansas and Nicaragua.

The author misspells seven names and scrambles others. Miguel Teurbe-Tolón, who designed the Cuban flag and coat-of-arms, appears as José Teurbe-Tolón and as Miguel Tolón. Lieutenant Colonel John T. Pickett is also identified as William S. Pickett, and Venezuelan Ildefonso Oberto-Urdaneta is mentioned as the Cuban Urdaneta Oberto. The Mobile U.S. Attorney is called both Peter and Paul Hamilton. Some notes are inaccurate, and in one, General William Worth, "in fact," died in May 1848 (p. 229), but three months later he is with Ambrosio Gonzales (p. 45). López confers with Jefferson Davis in July 1848, although they did not meet until the following year.

The account of the 1849 Round Island expedition, which resulted in a nearly three-month U.S. naval blockade, is compressed into two pages. Chaffin elides that the governor of Mississippi denounced it as a violation of states' rights, bringing that issue for the first time into U.S. foreign policy. The description of the capture of Cárdenas, drawn mostly from two contemporary American sources, is limited to six pages. In contrast, Portell Vilá dedicated ninety-five pages to it. Chaffin relies on an erroneous oral source to say that "North Americans," and not the Count of Villanueva, founded Cárdenas. The city grid was laid out not by Yankees, but by Andrés José de la Portilla. Only two contemporary publications are cited to briefly describe the three 1851 filibuster trials in New Orleans for violation of the Neutrality Law. There is no mention of the other filibuster federal court proceedings in Key West, Jacksonville, and New York. As a result, the López filibuster epic still needs revision from a wider perspective of bilingual primary sources.